

Tattva Viveka

an analysis of Western Philosophies

By Sri Thakur Bhaktivinoda

Prathamanubhava - Sadanusilanam (incomplete)

1) *jayati saccidananda rasanubhava vigraha procyate saccidanandanubhutiryat prasada*

All glories to Sri Krishna Chaitanya Mahaprabhu, the Personality who tastes the transcendental mellow of eternity, knowledge and bliss - by whose mercy the realization of Sri Krishna the eternally existent transcendental Absolute Truth is explained in this book.

2) *ko'ham va kimidam visvabhavayoh ko'nvayoh dhruvam atmanam nivrto jivah prcchati jnanasiddhaye*

After many many lifetimes the living entity who is wise develops the following inquiries:

a) Who am I? b) What is this material existence in reality? c) What is the actual relationship between me and this creation?

3) *atma prakrtivaicitya addadati citramuttaram svasvropasthito hyatma dadati yuktamuttaram*

The conditioned soul due to influence of the variegatedness of external illusory energy, gives multifarious (contradictory) answers, whereas the soul who is situated in his constitutional position gives united, (absolute) Krishna conscious answers.

The basic variation is due to the contamination of conditioning, and then due to the various places, languages and origins the variations become multifarious. But scientifically they can be divided into two, speculative, *jnana* and fruitive, *karma*.

Jnana is the visual faculty of the conditioned soul to discriminate between the eternal and transient objects. (1) upholds the material character by revealing the beginninglessness and the universal aboriginality of the matter. (2) analytically denies the existence of the matter and establishes a featureless doctrine of Brahman without any qualities.

Karma is the atheistic activity of the fallen souls in cultivating the material association by means of the gross body.

4) *citram bahuvividham viddhi yuktamekam svarupatah citramadou tatha cante yuktameva vivicyate*

Conditioned philosophies are of variegated natures whereas the Krishna conscious philosophy is absolute and constitutional; We will first describe the conditional and thereafter explain the constitutional.

Among the conditioned religious doctrines, materialism is a most prominent one. This has two categories: of material bliss and materialistic extinction.

Material bliss is of two types : selfish and unselfish.

Selfish: engage in sensual pleasures by being somewhat cautious against the immediate consequences. No use in wasting time in religious activities. Due to the company of unholy and evil activities. Not society oriented.

Carvaka, Yangchoo of China, Leucippus of Greece, Sardanaplua of middle Asia, Lucretius of Rome.

Unselfish: the modern day advocates have compiled their philosophies after a type of unselfish materialistic bliss, in view to gaining the faith of the masses.

Von Holbach, Ramakrsna and Vivekananda.

Karma:

Purva Mimamsakas have established something called 'Apurva' in the place of God.

Democritus of Greece established similar idea : matter and void are eternal. Union of matter with void results in creation and separation of the matter, in destruction. differences are due to quantity. No distinction in class. Knowledge is feeling generated by the union of internal and external objects. Atom is the basis of all matter.

Vaiseshika philosophy by Kanada accepts the eternal distinction of classification of the atoms and this is in some way different than the atomic theory of Democritus. Atma and Paramatma have been accepted as eternal.

Plato and Aristotle of Greece also have not accepted the Supreme Lord alone as the eternal principle and the only source of the entire universe. In this way the defects of Kanada are also seen in their ideas.

Gassendi concludes that God is the creator of atoms.

Diderot and Lamettrie of France have preached the unselfish material bliss.

Comte of France found the maturity of unselfish material bliss philosophy in his Positivism. Except material aspects and phenomenal rules nothing else is revealed by this. Sense organs are the only instruments of knowledge. It is impossible to determine anything as ultimate cause. Nothing can be understood about the beginning or purpose of the world. No sentient creator. All mental aspects of thought should be arranged according to the mutual relation, result, similarity and dissimilarity. It is not proper to attach any transcendental feelings in them. God Consciousness is infancy, and philosophical thoughts are childish. Resolute thinking is mature . All activities should be conducted in compliance to right and

wrong, life should be unselfish in the help of others. For cultivating these tendencies one should imagine an embodiment of female form for worship. Even though it is unreal it will help in the fulfillment of the tendencies. Earth is supreme fetich, land is supreme medium, and human nature is supreme being. A female idol with a baby in the hand should be worshipped three times a day. Mother, wife and daughter should be worshipped mentally as past present and future. No fruit should be sought.

Mill of England has named this as sentimentalism and subscribed to same theory as Comte's.

Godless secularism is the philosophy of Mill, Lewis, Paine, Carlyle, Bentham.

This has two types too. Holyoake has graciously accepted God to some extent. Bradlaugh, is totally an atheist.

Reply:

1. If matter is accepted as origin, the external existence of various atoms, eternity of void, inconceivable relationship between matter and void, the eternity of energy, nature and the activities of the atoms etc., have to be accepted. Otherwise universal creation will be impossibility. Thus the fundamental principles become innumerable instead of unification. Also time cannot be understood.

2. cause and effect are the nature of the mundane world. The philosophy of consciousness is the quality of matter and matter is the cause of creation is unscientific.

3. It is stupid to say that consciousness is controller by dead matter - Professor Ferris elaborately discusses this.

4. Due to the lack of evidence, eternity of matter cannot be accepted. Prof Tyndall has established this. (Buchner and Molescott have the idea that matter is eternal)

5. Consciousness cannot give away natural inquisitiveness. Investigation after the faculty of cause and effect is the mother of science. If one follows Comte within no time all human intelligence will be lost and human will become inert matter.

6. No one has proved production of consciousness from matter.

7. The organized conducting of creation shows that there is a conscious being behind it.

5) *atmathava jadam sarvam svabhavaddhi pravartate svabhavo vidyate nityamisajnanam nirarthakam*

Either the soul or the inert matter - all these are only the product of material nature; Material nature is the eternal principle; Knowledge about so called God is quite useless

6) *sarvatha cesvarasiddhirisakarta prayojanat paralokakatha mithya dhurtanam kalpanerita*

In all cases the origin should be found out; So if a person or principle is established as God, the creator, then it is necessary to find out who created Him. The stories about other worlds (after death) are all false, they are only the imaginations of c heaters.

7) *samyogajjadatattvanamatma caitanyasajnitah praturbhavati dharmo'yam nihito jadavastuni*

By the combination of material principles, consciousness, which is the inherent quality of matter, known as soul, manifests. And thus, various material things are placed in the world.

8) *viyogat sa punastatra gacchatyeva na samsayah na tasya punaravrttirna muktirjnanalaksana*

When this process is reversed the consciousness again disappears, attaining the original state of entrance into material elements; Of this there is no doubt; There is neither the question of rebirth of the soul nor it is wise, at all, to speak of it's liberation

9) *kartavyo loukiko dharmah papanam viratiryatah vidvadbhir laksito nityo svabhavavihito vidhih*

One should be disciplined in worldly dealings and refrain from sinful activities; Since the nature is always lawful, the learned ones should see the rules of nature

10) *punkhanu punkharupena jijnasyo sa sukhapraye jivane yat sukham tatttu jivanasya prayojanam*

The wise should enquire in detail the laws of nature by which (sensual) happiness can be derived; By following such rules whatever happiness is experienced in this life is the summum bonum of life.

11) *jivane yat krtam karma jivanante tadeva hi jagatamanyajivanam sambande phalam bhavet*

The activities done in life, at the end of life, will certainly bear fruit for other living entities of the world, in toto.

12) *na karma nasamayati yada va yena va krtam apurvasaktrirupena kurute sarvamunnatam*

Even if the result of the activities are lost in a short time, the various activities at their maturity will produce an unprecedented potency that will elevate the entire universe. (Therefore the activities will provide unselfish gain for the performer).

13) *bhavah kleso'bhavah kesam mate soukhyamiti sthitam nirvanasukhasampraptih sariraklesasadhanat*

Materialists think that material happiness (removal of material misery) is permanent bliss; (So they work either selfishly or selflessly and enjoy it); (Those who cannot remain satisfied with material happiness) thinking that existence itself

is misery, even by accepting bodily miseries try to attain non-existence (material extinction).

14) *kecidvadanti maya ya sa kartri jagatam kila cidacitsavini suksma saktirupa sanatani*

Some say that an eternal potency called 'maya' has created the entire manifestation; This subtle natured energy is the cause of both matter and spirit.

15) *athava bhava evasyat nesvaro na jagajjanah bhavo nitya vicitratma nabhavo vidyate kvacit*

Others do not accept anything except (mental) feelings; There is neither a controller (God), nor the objective world; Only the feelings are existent; The soul is no subjective reality and other than feelings nothing remains.

16) *sanyameva tvasannityam sadevanitya bhavana kecidvadanti mayandha yuktivada parayana*

Whatever exists in this world is seen to be transient; At the end all existence become non-existence; Therefore non-existence itself is real and eternal; This theory is essenceless and blind philosophers have posed this idea out of argumentativeness.

17) *sarvesam nastikanam vai matametad puratanam desabhasa-vibhedena laksitamca prthak prthak*

All these atheistic conceptions (potentialism, sentimentalism and scepticism) are age old types; Due to the variation in the languages these philosophies are preached in different countries in different names.

18) *karmajnanamisra ya yuktistarkamayo nare citramatapasuri sa samsaraphaladayini*

Those who have fruitive and speculative mixed reasoning, full of arguments and debates, follow the speculative philosophies which result in bondage of *samsara*, of repeated birth and death.

19) *yuktestu jadajataya jadatite na yojana atho jadasrita yuktirtadvadatyevam pralapanam*

The mixed reasoning is born of matter; It has no scope for anything beyond matter (i.e., transcendental). Therefore, those who take shelter of materialistic rationalisation simply wrangle in material platform.

20) *pralapantiha sa yukti rudanti svatmasiddhaye carame paramesanam svikaroti bhayatara*

Since most of the human beings are advocates of the mixed reasoning, the constitutional unalloyed reasoning is quite rare in this world. Ultimately frustrated because of not finding any delight in these speculations, out of fear and anxiety one accepts the Supreme Lord as the cause of all causes.

21) *kadacidisatattve sa jadabhranta pralapani
dvaitam traitam bahutvam varopayatyeva yatnatah*

Due to materialistic bewilderment, even after accepting God as a principle, one finds difficulty in accepting his Absolute Supremacy; Again wrangling with materialistic reasoning one endeavors to speculate the following kinds of philosophies:

Duality: accepting both matter and spirit as divinity; (this creates a competitor - Satan - to God)

Trinity: accepting three divinities

Multiplicity: accepting many divinities

incomplete